“Bahiya, you should train yourself thus.”

In reference to the seen, there will be only the seen. To the heard, only the heard. To the sensed, only the sensed. To the cognized, only the cognized.

When for you there will be only the seen in reference to the seen, only the heard in the heard, only the sensed in the sensed, only the cognized in the cognized, then, Bahiya, there’s no you in that.

When there’s no you in that, there’s no you there. When there’s no you there, you are neither here nor yonder nor between the two.

This, just this, is the end of all suffering.

The Buddha
The Neuropsychology of Anatta: Not-Self in the Brain

White Heron Sangha
May 19, 2012

Rick Hanson, Ph.D.
The Wellspring Institute For Neuroscience and Contemplative Wisdom
drrh@comcast.net
Topics

- Perspectives
- The power of mindfulness
- “Self” in the mind
- “Self” in the brain
- Healthy narcissistic supplies
- Taking life less personally
- “Only the seen in the seen . . .”
Perspectives
Common - and Fertile - Ground

Neuroscience  Psychology

Contemplative Practice
Do not go by oral tradition, by lineage of teaching, by hearsay, by a collection of texts, by logic, by inferential reasoning, by reasoned cognition, by the acceptance of a view after pondering it, by the seeming competence of a speaker, or because you think, “this . . . is our teacher.”

But when you know for yourselves, “these things are wholesome, these things are blameless; these things are praised by the wise; these things, if undertaken and practiced, lead to welfare and happiness,” then you should engage in them.

The Buddha
We ask, “What is a thought?”

We don’t know,

yet we are thinking continually.

Venerable Tenzin Palmo
The Power of Mindfulness
Why Mindfulness Matters

- Attention is like a spotlight, illuminating what it rests upon.

- Because neuroplasticity is heightened for what pay attention to, attention is also like a vacuum cleaner, sucking its contents into the brain.

- Directing attention skillfully - the essence of mindfulness - is therefore a fundamental way to shape the brain - and one’s life - over time.

*The education of attention would be the education par excellence.*

William James
Basics of Meditation

- Relax
- Posture that is comfortable and alert
- Simple good will toward yourself
- Awareness of your body
- Focus on something to steady your attention
- Accepting whatever passes through awareness, not resisting it or chasing it
- Gently settling into peaceful well-being
Seven Neural Factors of Mindfulness

- **Setting an intention** - “top-down” frontal, “bottom-up” limbic
- **Relaxing the body** - parasympathetic nervous system
- **Feeling cared about** - social engagement system
- **Feeling safer** - inhibits amygdala/ hippocampus alarms
- **Encouraging positive emotion** - dopamine, norepinephrine
- **Panoramic view** - lateral networks
- **Absorbing the benefits** - positive implicit memories
Meditation - Neural Benefits

- Increased gray matter in the:
  - Insula - interoception; self-awareness; empathy for emotions
  - Hippocampus - visual-spatial memory; establishing context; inhibiting amygdala and cortisol
  - Prefrontal cortex (PFC) - executive functions; attention control

- Reduced cortical thinning with aging in insula and PFC

- Increased activation of left frontal regions, lifting mood

- Increased gamma-range brainwaves - may be associated with integration, “coming to singleness,” “unitary awareness”

- Preserved telomere length
**Meditation: Physiological Benefits**

- Decreases stress-related cortisol
- Stronger immune system
- Helps many medical conditions, including cardiovascular disease, asthma, type II diabetes, PMS, and chronic pain
- Aids wound healing and post-surgical recovery
Meditation: Psychological Benefits

- Improves attention (including for ADHD)
- Increases compassion
- Increases empathy
- Reduces insomnia, anxiety, phobias, eating disorders
- MBCT for depression decreases relapse
“Self” in the Mind
Definitions

- **Person** - The body-mind as a whole
  - Contains knowledge, personal memories, skills, temperament, personality tendencies, mood, etc.
  - Has considerable consistency over time
  - Deserves kindness and justice; is morally culpable

- **Self** - “I, me, and mine”
  - Psychological self; the “I” in “I am happy, I want a cookie, I know 2+2=4, I am for justice”; the “me” in “Do you love me?”
  - The apparent owner of experiences and agent of actions

- **Awareness** - The field in which the mind (as yet mysteriously) represents aspects of the mind to itself
  - “Global workspace” in which representations of the person, self-related functions, and subjectivity arise and pass away
Conventional Notions of “Self”

- **Unified** - coherent; just one; a being, an entity; some one looking out through your eyes.

- **Stable** - unchanging in its fundamentals; the core self as a child still feels present in you today.

- **Independent** - things happen to the self, but it remains free of their effects in its essence.

- **Identity** - That which one is; that with which there is the greatest identification.
Actual Experience of “Self”

- **Compounded** – Made up of many parts; one self vows to exercise early, another self turns off the alarm clock.

- **Impermanent** – More or less present at different times; different aspects come forward at different times.

- **Dependent** – Developed in interactions with caregivers and peers and encounters with the world; grounded in evolution; activating and deactivating as a means to the ends of the organism; especially responsive to opportunities and threats; self organizes around clinging; there is a process of selfing rather than a static, fixed, unchanging entity.

- **Part of the person** – There is awareness of aspects of self as contents within awareness like any others.
The dualistic ego-mind is essentially a survival mechanism, on a par with the fangs, claws, stingers, scales, shells, and quills that other animals use to protect themselves.

By maintaining a separate self-sense, it attempts to provide a haven of security.

Yet the very boundaries that create a sense of safety also leave us feeling cut off and disconnected.

John Welwood
Actual Experience of “Self”

- **Compounded** – Made up of many parts; one self vows to exercise early, another self turns off the alarm clock.

- **Impermanent** – More or less present at different times; different aspects come forward at different times.

- **Dependent** – Developed in interactions with caregivers and peers and encounters with the world; grounded in evolution; activating and deactivating as a means to the ends of the organism; especially responsive to opportunities and threats; self organizes around clinging; there is a process of selfing rather than a static, fixed, unchanging entity.

- **Part of the person** – There is awareness of aspects of self as contents within awareness like any others.
“Self” in the Brain
Properties of Self in Your Brain

- **Compounded** – Distributed systems and sub-systems; no homunculus looking through your eyes

- **Impermanent** – Circuits light up and deactivate; fluid, transient

- **Dependent** – Dependent on neural structures and processes; dependent on the evolution of specialized neural tissues (e.g., spindle cells); responsive to stimuli;

- **Part of the person** – Self-related activations in neural circuitry are just a tiny fraction of the total activations in the brain
  - The neural circuitry associated with self representations or functions also performs many other activities unrelated to self.
  - In the brain, self is not special.
Subjectivity Doesn’t Equal a Subject

- Ordinary awareness has an inherent subjectivity, a localization to a particular perspective (e.g., to my body, not yours).

- The brain indexes across experiences of subjectivity to create an apparent subject.

- That apparent subject is elaborated and layered through the maturation of the brain, notably regions of the prefrontal cortex.

- But there is no subject *inherent* in subjectivity!

- Awareness requires subjectivity, but not a subject.
What Self?

In sum, from a neurological standpoint, the everyday feeling of being a unified self is an utter illusion:

- The apparently coherent and solid “I” is actually built from many neural subsystems, with no fixed center.
- The apparently stable “I” is produced by variable and transient activations of neural circuits.
- The apparently independent “I” depends on neural circuitry, the evolutionary processes that built them, critical interactions with others to shape those circuits, and the stimuli of the moment.

*Neurologically, self is “empty” - without absolute, inherent existence.*
Self-related patterns of information and neural activity are as real as those that underlie the smell of roses.

But that which they point to – a unified, enduring, independent “I” – just doesn’t exist.

Just because we have a sense of self does not mean that we are a self. The brain strings together heterogenous moments of self-ing and subjectivity into an illusion of homogenous coherence and continuity.

Real representations in the brain of a horse point to something that is also real. But the real representations of a unicorn in the brain point to something that is not real.

The real representations of the self in the brain point to another mythical creature: the apparent self.
Selflessness is not a case of something that existed in the past becoming nonexistent. Rather, this sort of “self” is something that never did exist. What is needed is to identify as nonexistent something that always was nonexistent.

The Dalai Lama

When we recognize that the things we identify as our self are impermanent and bound up with suffering, we realize they lack the essential marks of authentic selfhood and we thereby stop identifying with them.

Venerable Bhikkhu Bodhi
Selfing Leads to Suffering

- When “I, me, and mine” are mental objects like any other, there’s no problem.
  - For example, the Buddha routinely used “I” and “you.”

- But when we privilege self-representations through identifying with them or defending or glorifying them . . . Then we suffer, and create suffering for others.

- The key is to be able to move dextrously into and back out of self-representations; that’s skillful means.
No self, 
no problem
Blissful is passionlessness in the world,
The overcoming of sensual desires;
But the abolition of the conceit I am --
That is truly the supreme bliss.

The Buddha, Udāna 2.11
To study the Way is to study the self.

To study the self is to forget the self.

To forget the self is
To be enlightened by all things.

Dogen
Dual Modes
## Dual Modes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>“Doing”</th>
<th>“Being”</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mainly representational</td>
<td>Mainly sensory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Much verbal activity</td>
<td>Little verbal activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>Concrete</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Future- or past-focused</td>
<td>Now-focused</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goal-directed</td>
<td>Nothing to do, nowhere to go</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sense of craving</td>
<td>Sense of peace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal, self-oriented perspective</td>
<td>Impersonal, 3rd person perspective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focal view</td>
<td>Uncertainty, not-knowing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Firm beliefs</td>
<td>Nonjudgmental</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluative</td>
<td>Mindful presence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lost in thought, mind wandering</td>
<td>Immediate and transient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reverberation and recursion</td>
<td>Loosely connected experiences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tightly connected experiences</td>
<td>Minimal or no self-as-object</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prominent self-as-object</td>
<td>Minimal or no self-as-subject</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prominent self-as-subject</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Increased **Medial** PFC Activation Related to Self-Referencing Thought

Cortical **Midline** Areas for Self-Referencing Thought

Self-Focused (blue) and Open Awareness (red) Conditions (in the novice, pre MT group)

Self-Focused (blue) vs Open Awareness (red) Conditions (following 8 weeks of MT)

# Dual Modes

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>“Doing”</th>
<th>“Being”</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Mainly representational</td>
<td>Mainly sensory</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Much verbal activity</td>
<td>Little verbal activity</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Abstract</td>
<td>Concrete</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Future- or past-focused</td>
<td>Now-focused</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Goal-directed</td>
<td>Nothing to do, nowhere to go</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sense of craving</td>
<td>Sense of peace</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Personal, self-oriented perspective</td>
<td>Impersonal, 3rd person perspective</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Focal view</td>
<td>Panoramic view</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Firm beliefs</td>
<td>Uncertainty, not-knowing</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Evaluative</td>
<td>Nonjudgmental</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lost in thought, mind wandering</td>
<td>Mindful presence</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Reverberation and recursion</td>
<td>Immediate and transient</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Tightly connected experiences</td>
<td>Loosely connected experiences</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prominent self-as-object</td>
<td>Minimal or no self-as-object</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Prominent self-as-subject</td>
<td>Minimal or no self-as-subject</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
“Bahiya, you should train yourself thus.”

In reference to the seen, there will be only the seen. To the heard, only the heard. To the sensed, only the sensed. To the cognized, only the cognized.

When for you there will be only the seen in reference to the seen, only the heard in the heard, only the sensed in the sensed, only the cognized in the cognized, then, Bahiya, there’s no you in that.

When there’s no you in that, there’s no you there. When there’s no you there, you are neither here nor yonder nor between the two.

This, just this, is the end of all suffering.

The Buddha
Ways to Activate “Being” Mode

- Relax
- Focus on bare sensations and perceptions
- Sense the body as a whole
- Take a panoramic, “bird’s–eye” view
- Engage “don’t-know mind”; release judgments
- Don’t try to connect mental contents together
- Let experience flow, staying here now
- Relax the sense of “I, me, and mine”
Whole Body Awareness

- Sense the breath in one area (e.g., chest, upper lip)
- Sense the breath as a whole: one gestalt, percept
- Sense the body as a whole, a whole body breathing
- Sense experience as a whole: sensations, sounds, thoughts . . . all arising together as one unified thing
- It’s natural for this sense of the whole to be present for a second or two, then crumble; just open up to it again and again.
Panoramic Awareness

- Recall a bird’s-eye view (e.g., mountain, airplane)
- Be aware of sounds coming and going in an open space of awareness, without any edges: boundless
- Open to other contents of mind, coming and going like clouds moving across the sky.
- Pleasant or unpleasant, no matter: just more clouds
- No cloud ever harms or taints the sky.
Healthy “Narcissistic Supplies”
Feeding the Hungry Heart

Healthy development requires caregivers to give a child extensive mirroring, attunement, and prizing; healthy adult relationships require much the same.

These are normal “narcissistic supplies.” Deficits in them lead to:
  - Feelings of inadequacy, worthlessness, and shame
  - Tendencies toward extremes of clinging or distance

As an adult, you can take in narcissistic supplies, gradually weaving them into your brain and your being.

This is not clinging to praise, etc. It is filling the hole in your heart so your happiness is increasingly unconditional - not dependent on external events.
How to Take in the Good (TIG)

1. **Have** a good experience.
   - You are already having one.
   - You deliberately recognize a good fact and let it become a good experience.

2. **Extend** the good experience in:
   - Time - for 10-20-30+ seconds
   - Space - in your body and feelings
   - Intensity - help it become stronger

3. **Absorb** the good experience by intending and sensing that is becoming a part of you, woven into the fabric of your brain and being.
Self-Compassion

- Compassion is the wish that a being not suffer, combined with sympathetic concern. Self-compassion simply applies that to oneself. It is not self-pity, complaining, or wallowing in pain.

- Studies show that self-compassion buffers stress and increases resilience and self-worth.

- But self-compassion is hard for many people, due to feelings of unworthiness, self-criticism, or “internalized oppression.” To encourage the neural substrates of self-compassion:
  - Get the sense of being cared about by someone else.
  - Bring to mind someone you naturally feel compassion for
  - Sink into the experience of compassion in your body
  - Then shift the compassion to yourself, perhaps with phrases like: “May I not suffer. May the pain of this moment pass.”
Feeling Prized

- It is natural and important to feel that your person is special to others: appreciated, acknowledged, respected, cherished, prized.

- Bring to mind experiences of:
  - Being praised, complimented, acknowledged
  - A time you knew you were appreciated, perhaps after some contribution or generosity
  - Being wanted by someone; wanted by a group
  - Feeling cherished by someone

- In daily life, look for experiences of being prized, including in small ways, and then savor them so they sink in.
Feeling Like a Good Person

Everyone has good qualities. No halo is required to have patience, determination, fairness, curiosity, honesty, kindness, etc.

Recognizing these qualities in yourself is simply seeing reality with clear eyes, just like recognizing good food in your cupboard or good qualities in another person.

Methods:

- Pick a good quality that you know you have.
- Pay attention to any obstructions to recognizing and appreciating this good quality. Let them be... then let them go and return attention to the good quality.
- Gather evidence for this good quality in you (e.g., examples).
- Be mindful of what the good quality feels like in your body and mind; let it sink in.
- Consider how this good quality contributes to yourself and to others.
- Open to a simple gladness for this good quality; let it sink in.
Taking Life Less Personally
Relaxing Selfing: Perspectives

- You need a coherence of person to relax selfing.

- Cautions: dissociative disorders; borderline personality disorder; “spacey, airy” people

- Distinguish between the person (the body-mind as a whole) and the apparent self (the supposedly unified, stable, and independent owner of experiences and agent of actions).

- Enjoy the peace of less selfing.
Using Mindfulness to Relax Selfing

- Notice how little “I” there is in many activities (e.g., reaching for salt, cuddling); take in that sense of minimal selfing combined with life being OK.

- Notice how “I” changes; see how it grows in response to threats, opportunities, and contact with others; consider the apparent “I” as a process rather than as an being.

- Focus on present moment experience as a process.

- Be mindful of yourself as the protagonist in the “mini-movies” running in the mind.

- Beware presuming that others are intentionally targeting you.
Egocentric and Allocentric
Egocentric Perspective

- Based on upper processing streams in the brain: upper portions of the thalamus that confer “self” salience; rear regions of the “default network” (e.g., precuneus, posterior cingulate cortex); parietal regions that construct an enduring and unified sense of “my body in space”

- Establishes “where it is in relation to me”; lower visual field

- Develops earliest in childhood

- “Subjective” - Things exist in relation to me.

- Action-oriented - Focus on reacting to carrots and sticks
Allocentric Perspective

- Based on lower processing streams in the brain that involve: lower regions of the thalamus that confer “world” salience;

- Establishes “what it is independent of me”; upper visual field

- Begins developing around age four

- “Objective” - Things exist in a physical space in which their location is impersonal, not in reference to the viewpoint of an observer.

- This perspective pervades kensho and other forms of non-dual awareness. It is strengthened in open awareness meditations that draw heavily on the alerting, lower attentional system.

- Being-oriented
Strengthening Allocentric Processing

- As one perspective increases, the other decreases. Normal ego/allo fluctuations occur ~ 3-4/minute.

- With “contact,” allocentric processing increases briefly as the new stimulus is considered in its own right; then egocentric processing surges forward as one figures out what to do about the “feeling tone” (pleasant, unpleasant, neutral) of the stimulus.

- Open awareness practices in which there are many moments of new contact could incline the brain toward allocentric modes.

- Lower regions of the thalamus and its reticular cap - with concentrations of GABA neurons - inhibit egocentric processing.

- Reducing wanting reduces egocentric processing.
Liking and Wanting

- Distinct neural systems for liking and wanting

- In the brain: feeling tone --> enjoying (liking) --> wanting --> pursuing
  - Wanting without liking is hell.
  - Liking without wanting is heaven.

- The distinction between *chandha* (wholesome wishes and aspirations) and *tanha* (craving)

- But beware: the brain usually wants (craves) and pursues (clings) to what it likes.
“Only the Seen in the Seen . . .”
“Bahiya, you should train yourself thus.”

In reference to the seen, there will be only the seen. To the heard, only the heard. To the sensed, only the sensed. To the cognized, only the cognized.

When for you there will be only the seen in reference to the seen, only the heard in the heard, only the sensed in the sensed, only the cognized in the cognized, then, Bahiya, there’s no you in that.

When there’s no you in that, there’s no you there. When there’s no you there, you are neither here nor yonder nor between the two.

This, just this, is the end of all suffering.

The Buddha
Be wisdom itself,
rather than a person who isn’t wise
trying to become wise.

Trust in awareness, in being awake,
rather than in transient and unstable conditions.

Ajahn Sumedho
Be still
*Listen to the stones of the wall*
Be silent, they try
*To speak your*

*Name.*
*Listen to the living walls.*
*Who are you?*
*Who*
*Are you? Whose*
*Silence are you?*

Thomas Merton
Great Books

See www.RickHanson.net for other great books.

See [www.RickHanson.net](http://www.RickHanson.net) for other scientific papers.


Key Papers - 2


- Hanson, R. 2008. Seven facts about the brain that incline the mind to joy. In *Measuring the immeasurable: The scientific case for spirituality*. Sounds True.
Key Papers - 3


Key Papers - 4


Where to Find Rick Hanson Online

http://www.youtube.com/BuddhasBrain
http://www.facebook.com/BuddhasBrain

www.RickHanson.net
www.WiseBrain.org